# Pictorial structures for object recognition 

Josef Sivic<br>http://www.di.ens.fr/~josef<br>Equipe-projet WILLOW, ENS/INRIA/CNRS UMR 8548<br>Laboratoire d'Informatique, Ecole Normale Supérieure, Paris

With slides from: A. Zisserman,
$M$. Everingham and $P$. Felzenszwalb

## Pictorial Structure

- Intuitive model of an object
- Model has two components

1. parts (2D image fragments)
2. structure (configuration of parts)


- Dates back to Fischler \& Elschlager 1973


## Recall : Generative part-based models (Lecture 7)


R. Fergus, P. Perona and A. Zisserman,

Object Class Recognition by Unsupervised Scale-Invariant Learning, CVPR 2003

## Recall: Discriminative part-based model (Lecture 9)

[Felsenszwalb et al. 2009]


Localize multi-part objects at arbitrary locations in an image

- Generic object models such as person or car
- Allow for articulated objects
- Simultaneous use of appearance and spatial information
- Provide efficient and practical algorithms


To fit model to image: minimize an energy (or cost) function that reflects both

- Appearance: how well each part matches at given location
- Configuration: degree to which parts match 2D spatial layout


## Example: cow layout



## Example: cow layout



Each vertex corresponds to a part - 'Head', 'Torso', 'Legs’
Edges define a TREE

Assign a label to each vertex from $\mathrm{H}=\{$ positions $\}$

## Example: cow layout



Graph $G=(V, E)$
Each vertex corresponds to a part - 'Head', 'Torso', 'Legs’
Edges define a TREE

Assign a label to each vertex from $\mathrm{H}=\{$ positions $\}$

## Example: cow layout



Each vertex corresponds to a part - 'Head', 'Torso', 'Legs’
Edges define a TREE

Assign a label to each vertex from $\mathrm{H}=\{$ positions $\}$

## Example: cow layout



Cost of a labelling $\mathrm{L}: \mathrm{V} \rightarrow \mathrm{H}$
Unary cost : How well does part match image patch?
Pairwise cost : Encourages valid configurations
Find best labelling L*

## Example: cow layout



Find best labelling L* by minimizing energy:

$$
L^{*}=\arg \min _{L}\left(\sum_{i=1}^{n} m_{i}\left(l_{i}\right)+\sum_{\left(v_{i}, v_{j}\right) \in E} d_{i j}\left(l_{i}, l_{j}\right)\right)
$$

## The General Problem



Graph $G=(V, E)$
Discrete label set $H=\{1,2, \ldots, h\}$
Assign a label to each vertex $L: V \rightarrow H$

Cost of a labelling $E(L)$
Unary Cost + n-nary cost (depends on the size of maximal cliques of the graph)

Find $L^{*}=\arg \min E(L) \quad[B i s h o p, 2006]$

## Computational Complexity

Fitting
$|\mathrm{H}|^{|\mathrm{V}|}=h^{\mathrm{n}}$
n parts

h positions

$$
\text { e.g. } h=\text { number of pixels }(512 \times 300) \approx 153600
$$

## Different graph structures

Can use dynamic programming


## Brute force solutions intractable

- With $n$ parts and $h$ possible discrete locations per part, $O\left(h^{n}\right)$
- For a tree, using dynamic programming this reduces to $\mathrm{O}\left(\mathrm{nh}^{2}\right)$

If model is a tree and has quadratic edge costs then complexity reduces to $\mathrm{O}(\mathrm{nh})$ (using a distance transform)

Felzenszwalb \& Huttenlocher, IJCV, 2004

## Distance transforms for DP

## Special case of DP cost function

## Distance transforms

- $\mathrm{O}\left(\mathrm{nh}^{2}\right) \rightarrow \mathrm{O}(\mathrm{nh})$ for DP cost functions
- Assume model is quadratic, i.e. $\phi\left(x_{k-1}, x_{k}\right)=\lambda^{2}\left(x_{k-1}-x_{k}\right)^{2}$

Recall that we need to compute

$$
\min _{x_{k-1}}\left\{S_{k-1}\left(x_{k-1}\right)+\phi\left(x_{k-1}, x_{k}\right)\right\}
$$

e.g. for $k=2$, compute for each value of $x_{2}$

$$
\min _{x_{1}}\left\{m_{1}\left(x_{1}\right)+\phi\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right)\right\}
$$

Plot $\min _{x_{1}}\left\{m_{1}\left(x_{1}\right)+\phi\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right)\right\}$ as function of $x_{2}$

Plot $\min _{x_{1}}\left\{m_{1}\left(x_{1}\right)+\phi\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right)\right\}$ as function of $x_{2}$


Plot $\min _{x_{1}}\left\{m_{1}\left(x_{1}\right)+\phi\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right)\right\}$ as function of $x_{2}$


## For each $\mathrm{x}_{2}$

- Finding min over $x_{1}$ is equivalent finding minimum over set of offset parabolas
- Lower envelope computed in $\mathrm{O}(\mathrm{h})$ rather than $\mathrm{O}\left(\mathrm{h}^{2}\right)$ via distance transform

Plot $\min _{x_{1}}\left\{m_{1}\left(x_{1}\right)+\phi\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right)\right\}$ as function of $x_{2}$


## For each $\mathrm{x}_{2}$

- Finding min over $x_{1}$ is equivalent finding minimum over set of offset parabolas
- Lower envelope computed in $\mathrm{O}(\mathrm{h})$ rather than $\mathrm{O}\left(\mathrm{h}^{2}\right)$ via distance transform

Plot $\min _{x_{1}}\left\{m_{1}\left(x_{1}\right)+\phi\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right)\right\}$ as function of $x_{2}$


## For each $\mathrm{x}_{2}$

- Finding min over $x_{1}$ is equivalent finding minimum over set of offset parabolas
- Lower envelope computed in $\mathrm{O}(\mathrm{h})$ rather than $\mathrm{O}\left(\mathrm{h}^{2}\right)$ via distance transform


## Generalized distance transform

Given a function $f: \mathcal{G} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$,

$$
\mathcal{D}_{f}(q)=\min _{p \in \mathcal{G}}\left(\|q-p\|^{2}+f(p)\right)
$$

- for each location $q$, find nearby location $p$ with $f(p)$ small.
- equals DT of points $P$ if $f$ is an indicator function.

$$
f(p)= \begin{cases}0 & \text { if } p \in P \\ \infty & \text { otherwise }\end{cases}
$$

## 1D Examples



## 1D Examples



There is a simple geometric algorithm that computes $\mathcal{D}_{f}(p)$ in $O(h)$ time for the 1 D case.

- similar to Graham's scan convex hull algorithm.
- about 20 lines of Code.

The 2D case is "separable", it can be solved by sequential 1D transformations along rows and columns of the grid.

See Distance Transforms of Sampled Functions, Felzenszwalb and Huttenlocher.

Algorithm is non-examinable

## "Lower Envelope" Algorithm




## Algorithm for Lower Envelope

- Quadratics ordered left to right
- At step j consider adding j-th quadratic to LE of first j-1 quadratics
- Maintain two ordered lists
> Quadratics currently visible on LE
> Intersections currently visible on LE
- Compute intersection of j-th quadratic and rightmost quadratic visible on LE
> If to right of rightmost visible intersection, add quadratic and intersection to lists
> If not, this quadratic hides at least rightmost quadratic, remove it and try again

Code available online: http://people.cs.uchicago.edu/~pff/dt/

## Running Time of LE Algorithm

Considers adding each of $h$ quadratics just once

- Intersection and comparison constant time
- Adding to lists constant time
- Removing from lists constant time
$>$ But then need to try again

Simple amortized analysis

- Total number of removals O(h)
> Each quadratic once removed never considered for removal again

Thus overall running time $\mathrm{O}(\mathrm{h})$

## Example: facial feature detection in images



- Parts $\mathrm{V}=\left\{\mathrm{v}_{1}, \ldots \mathrm{v}_{\mathrm{n}}\right\}$
- Connected by springs in star configuration to nose
- Quadratic cost for spring

$$
\begin{aligned}
& E(\mathbf{x})= \sum_{v_{i} \in V} m_{i}\left(v_{i}\right)+\sum_{e_{i j} \in E} d_{i j}\left(v_{i}, v_{j}\right) \\
&=\sum_{v_{i} \in V} m_{i}\left(v_{i}\right)+\sum_{j} d_{1, j}\left(v_{1}, v_{j}\right) \\
& \begin{array}{c}
1-\text { NcC with } \\
\text { appearance } \\
\text { template }
\end{array} \begin{array}{c}
\text { Spring } \\
\text { extension } \\
\text { from } v_{1} \text { to } \mathrm{v}_{j}
\end{array}
\end{aligned}
$$

Appearance templates and springs

$$
\begin{gathered}
E(\mathbf{x})=\sum_{v_{i} \in V} m_{i}\left(v_{i}\right)+\sum_{j} d_{1, j}\left(v_{1}, v_{j}\right) \\
\mathbf{x}=\left(x_{1}, y_{1}, \ldots, x_{4}, y_{4}\right)^{\top}
\end{gathered}
$$

Each $\mathrm{I}_{\mathrm{i}}=\left(\mathrm{x}_{\mathrm{i}}, \mathrm{y}_{\mathrm{i}}\right)$ ranges over $\mathrm{h}(\mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y})$ positions in the image


Requires pair wise terms for correct detection

## Fitting the model to an image

Find the configuration with the lowest energy

$$
E(\mathbf{x})=\sum_{v_{i} \in V} m_{i}\left(v_{i}\right)+\sum_{j} d_{1, j}\left(v_{1}, v_{j}\right)
$$

Model


## Fitting the model to an image

Find the configuration with the lowest energy

$$
E(\mathbf{x})=\sum_{v_{i} \in V} m_{i}\left(v_{i}\right)+\sum_{j} d_{1, j}\left(v_{1}, v_{j}\right)
$$

Model


## Fitting the model to an image

Find the configuration with the lowest energy

$$
E(\mathbf{x})=\sum_{v_{i} \in V} m_{i}\left(v_{i}\right)+\sum_{j} d_{1, j}\left(v_{1}, v_{j}\right)
$$

Model


## Notation

- Model is represented by a graph $G=(V, E)$.
$-V=\left\{v_{1}, \ldots, v_{n}\right\}$ are the parts.
- $\left(v_{i}, v_{j}\right) \in E$ indicates a connection between parts.
- $m_{i}\left(l_{i}\right)$ is the cost of placing part $i$ at location $l_{i}$.
- $d_{i j}\left(l_{i}, l_{j}\right)$ is a deformation cost.
- Optimal location for object is given by $L^{*}=\left(l_{1}^{*}, \ldots, l_{n}^{*}\right)$,

$$
L^{*}=\underset{L}{\operatorname{argmin}}\left(\sum_{i=1}^{n} m_{i}\left(l_{i}\right)+\sum_{\left(v_{i}, v_{j}\right) \in E} d_{i j}\left(l_{i}, l_{j}\right)\right)
$$

## Simple face model

- Locations are positions in the image grid.
- Match cost $m_{i}\left(l_{i}\right)$ for placing part $i$ at $l_{i}$.
- Central part $v_{1}$ - the nose.

- Each part has an ideal position $p_{i}$ relative to nose.
- Let $T_{1 i}\left(l_{1}\right)=l_{1}+p_{i}$,

$$
E\left(l_{1}, \ldots, l_{n}\right)=\sum_{i=1}^{n} m_{i}\left(l_{i}\right)+\sum_{i=2}^{n}\left\|l_{i}-T_{1 i}\left(l_{1}\right)\right\|^{2}
$$

## Efficient minimization

$$
\begin{aligned}
& L^{*}=\underset{L}{\operatorname{argmin}}\left(\sum_{i=1}^{n} m_{i}\left(l_{i}\right)+\sum_{i=2}^{n}\left\|l_{i}-T_{1 i}\left(l_{1}\right)\right\|^{2}\right) \\
& L^{*}=\underset{L}{\operatorname{argmin}}\left(m_{1}\left(l_{1}\right)+\sum_{i=2}^{n} m_{i}\left(l_{i}\right)+\left\|l_{i}-T_{1 i}\left(l_{1}\right)\right\|^{2}\right) \\
& l_{1}^{*}= \underset{l_{1}}{\operatorname{argmin}}\left(m_{1}\left(l_{1}\right)+\sum_{i=2}^{n} m_{l_{i}}\left(m_{i}\left(l_{i}\right)+\left\|l_{i}-T_{1 i}\left(l_{1}\right)\right\|^{2}\right)\right) \\
& l_{1}^{*}=\underset{l_{1}}{\operatorname{argmin}}\left(m_{1}\left(l_{1}\right)+\sum_{i=2}^{n} \mathcal{D}_{m_{i}}\left(T_{1 i}\left(l_{1}\right)\right)\right) \\
& \text { where } \mathcal{D}_{f}(q)=\min _{p \in \mathcal{G}}\left(\|q-p\|^{2}+f(p)\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Visualization: Compute part matching cost (dense)



Input image

Compute matching cost $m_{i}\left(l_{i}\right)$ for each pixel


## Visualization: Combine appearance with relative shape

Part matching cost $m_{i}\left(l_{i}\right)$


1. Nose

2. Left eye

3. Right eye

4. Mouth


$$
l_{1}^{*}=\underset{l_{1}}{\operatorname{argmin}}\left(m_{1}\left(l_{1}\right)+\sum_{i=2}^{n} \mathcal{D}_{m_{i}}\left(T_{1 i}\left(l_{1}\right)\right)\right)
$$

Combined matching cost

## Visualization: Combine appearance with relative shape

Part matching cost $m_{i}\left(l_{i}\right)$


1. Nose

2. Left eye

3. Right eye

4. Mouth



Combined matching cost


The best part configuration

## Combine appearance with relative shape

The distance transform can be computed separately for rows and columns of the image (i.e. is "separable"), which results in the $\mathrm{O}(\mathrm{hn})$ running time

Given the best location of the reference location (root), locations of leafs can be found by "back-tracking" (here only one level).

## Example



## Example of a model with 9 parts

The goal:
Localize facial features in faces output by face detector


Support parts-based face descriptors
Provide initialization for global face descriptors

Code available online: http://www.robots.ox.ac.uk/~vgg/research/nface/index.html

## Example of a model with 9 parts

Classifier for each facial feature

- Linear combination of thresholded simple image filters (Viola/Jones) trained discriminatively using AdaBoost
- Applied in "sliding window" fashion to patch around every pixel
- Similar to Viola\&Jones face detector - see lecture 6

Ambiguity e.g. due to facial symmetry


Resolve ambiguity using spatial model.

## Results

Nine facial features, $\sim 90 \%$ predicted positions within 2 pixels in $100 \times 100$ face image


Results


## Example II: Generic Person Model

## Each part represented as rectangle

- Fixed width, varying length, uniform colour
- Learn average and variation
> Connections approximate revolute joints
- Joint location, relative part position, orientation, foreshortening - Gaussian
- Estimate average and variation

Learned 10 part model

- All parameters learned
> Including "joint locations"
- Shown at ideal configuration (mean locations)



## Learning

Manual identification of

- rectangular parts in a set of
- training images hypotheses

Learn

- relative position (x \& y),
- relative angle,
- relative foreshortening



## Example: Recognizing People



NB: requires background subtraction

## Variety of Poses



## Variety of Poses



## Example III: Hand tracking for sign language interpretation



Pose estimation for sign language recognition

Signer 1
(5 min of an one hour sequence)

Distinctive frames are marked by a "D" in the upper right corner

Buehler et al. BMVC'2008

## Example results



## Example IV: Part based models for object detection (Recall from Lecture 9)

[Felsenszwalb et al. 2009]


- Each component has global template + deformable parts
- Fully trained from bounding boxes alone

Code available online: http://people.cs.uchicago.edu/~pff/latent/

## Bicycle model



root filters
coarse resolution

part filters finer resolution

deformation models

Each component has a root filter $F_{0}$ and $n$ part models ( $F_{i}, v_{i}, d_{i}$ )

## Object hypothesis



Multiscale model captures features at two-resolutions

## Score of a hypothesis



$$
\operatorname{score}(z)=\beta \cdot \Psi(H, z)
$$

concatenation filters and deformation parameters
concatenation of HOG features and part displacement features

## Matching

- Define an overall score for each root location
- Based on best placement of parts

$$
\operatorname{score}\left(p_{0}\right)=\max _{p_{1}, \ldots, p_{n}} \operatorname{score}\left(p_{0}, \ldots, p_{n}\right)
$$

- High scoring root locations define detections
-"sliding window approach"

